

## Pohle, David

---

**From:** Smith, Aaron C LRB <Aaron.C.Smith@usace.army.mil>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, July 28, 2015 2:05 PM  
**To:** Pohle, David  
**Subject:** RE: Web Inquiry Assigned: Formal complaints re: 13181 Sanford Road, Martville, NY: filled national wetland and protected Sterling Creek waters; endangered species; USACE and EPA lack of due diligence (UNCLASSIFIED)

Classification: UNCLASSIFIED

Caveats: NONE

Okay, I'll call you at 2:10...

-----Original Message-----

From: Pohle, David [mailto:Pohle.David@epa.gov]  
Sent: Tuesday, July 28, 2015 2:02 PM  
To: Smith, Aaron C LRB  
Cc: Linthicum, Benjamin  
Subject: [EXTERNAL] RE: Web Inquiry Assigned: Formal complaints re: 13181 Sanford Road, Martville, NY: filled national wetland and protected Sterling Creek waters; endangered species; USACE and EPA lack of due diligence (UNCLASSIFIED)

That's "Maggie and me" young man!

Yes - I'll include Ben, our intern investigating this. Just call me at (212) 637-384. I'll tie him in.

-----Original Message-----

From: Smith, Aaron C LRB [mailto:Aaron.C.Smith@usace.army.mil]  
Sent: Tuesday, July 28, 2015 1:31 PM  
To: Pohle, David  
Subject: RE: Web Inquiry Assigned: Formal complaints re: 13181 Sanford Road, Martville, NY: filled national wetland and protected Sterling Creek waters; endangered species; USACE and EPA lack of due diligence (UNCLASSIFIED)

Classification: UNCLASSIFIED

Caveats: NONE

Do you have 10-minutes to discuss this with Maggie and I?

-----Original Message-----

From: Pohle, David [mailto:Pohle.David@epa.gov]  
Sent: Tuesday, July 28, 2015 11:58 AM  
To: Smith, Aaron C LRB  
Cc: Montella, Daniel; Linthicum, Benjamin  
Subject: [EXTERNAL] FW: Web Inquiry Assigned: Formal complaints re: 13181 Sanford Road, Martville, NY: filled national wetland and protected Sterling Creek waters; endangered species; USACE and EPA lack of due diligence

Aaron,

We have to respond to this complaint this week. Your Auburn offices colleagues are named in the complaint and should know what is going on. Trying to narrow the complaint down to an enforcement focus, it alleges that CWA 404

violations exists within wetlands and a creek downslope of the logging. No evidence is presented for the allegation, but it is asserted that rainfall must have caused CWA 404-regulated fills from runoff, that would be violations.

Does this allegation have sufficient merit to warrant you traveling to this site for EPA to inspect the downslope wetlands to search for evidence proving or disproving this allegation?

Dave

From: Montella, Daniel  
Sent: Monday, July 27, 2015 9:01 AM  
To: Pohle, David  
Subject: FW: Web Inquiry Assigned: Formal complaints re: 13181 Sanford Road, Martville, NY: filled national wetland and protected Sterling Creek waters; endangered species; USACE and EPA lack of due diligence

I assigned this to you. In case you don't see the notification, the incoming is below

- Dan

From

"V. Fichera" <vmfichera@gmail.com>

Delivered Date

07/23/2015 03:53 PM

Subject

Formal complaints re: 13181 Sanford Road, Martville, NY: filled national wetland and protected Sterling Creek waters; endangered species; USACE and EPA lack of due diligence

Nota Bene:

The email below contains information concerning the status of the land at 13181 Sanford Road in Martville from September 2014 through June 2015, providing suspicion of runoff silt and sedimentation in the adjoining wetland and creek.

The documentation herein provides evidence of logging pre-October 2014, which could have endangered the habitat of the Indiana myotis bat and potentially other endangered species in the wetland and the stream. The USDA photographs at its Soil Map Website from September 14, 2014 (cf. [BLOCKEDwebsoilsurvey.nrcs.usda.gov/app/BLOCKED](http://BLOCKEDwebsoilsurvey.nrcs.usda.gov/app/BLOCKED) for the above address) show the intermediate stage of logging and the attached amateur drone photo shows the final grubbed status of approximately ten acres of the land above the national wetland and the Sterling Creek as of June 29, 2015 -- after the heavy snows and flash flood rains of the spring which almost certainly would have resulted in fill in the wetland and stream waters.

My personal conversation with the Alliance Archaeological Services owner (cf. email below) provides additional evidence of the timeline and of the lack of any storm water pollution control measures at the site subsequent to the logging and grubbing of the land by the permit applicant. The archaeologist also revealed that the permit applicant cleared the area with intentional disregard for the possible endangerment of the requisite archaeological studies because she verbally warned him about the area; his disregard of the logging, archaeological, and storm water protection protocols likely thereby threatened habitats of the endangered bat and other species, as well. The DEC was receiving multiple written assurances from the permit applicant throughout the period of June 2014 to May 2015 that the entire area was wooded, with the exception of the earlier mine location, and that the applicant would respect storm water pollution control practices; the controls apparently did not take place, as attested to both by the photographic evidence and the testimony of the archaeologist.

Please also consult the NFWS wetland finder maps as well as the DEC Christopher Construction map (cf. attached) which both clearly indicate the presence of a Federal palustrine wetland and protected Sterling Creek bordering the steep slopes upon which the permit applicant intends to mine gravel sixty feet deep above the wetland. If the Army Corps of Engineers has written documentation of a subsequent formal delineation of the wetland to justify the permit applicant's quoting the Army Corps as saying "There is no wetland there," please provide the name and date of the relevant documents so that I may add a request for their inspection to my July 5, 2015 formal FOIA request of the Army Corps which has not yet been acknowledged by the Buffalo District.

I would like to suggest that the NFWS and the Army Corps and the EPA consult the information contained on the NFWS wetland finder map as well as the attached DEC-generated map so that your multi-agency review and recommendations may be coordinated and include the Federal wetland and protected stream. I remind all parties that the information from these government maps and photographs, supplemented by amateur drone photography, supports my earlier and instant formal complaints to the Army Corps and to the NFWS that there may have been violations of the Federal laws and regulations which your agencies are sworn to protect by investigation and enforcement. To these I add the instant complaints to all three agencies, to include as well the EPA.

To date, the Army Corps of Engineers has failed to reply to correspondence, formal complaints, and evidence presented in these matters since the latter part of June 2015. The Army Corps of Engineers representative who visited the LOM on June 12, 2015 has, by her own admission, only walked the Life-of-Mine area, never visiting the wetland below. Therefore, the allegations proffered by the permit applicant that "There is no wetland there" are, to date, unsubstantiated by the Corps with any documentation in any of its minimal correspondence to the undersigned to date.

I therefore expect to receive responses to my FOIA request of the Corps, and to my formal complaints in these matters before both Federal agencies, with all agencies performing due diligence in these important environmental matters where the DEC, as well, has failed to perform due diligence in the NYS SEQR process, as documented in detail in correspondence sent to both the NFWF and the Army Corps of Engineers.

- Dr. V. M. Fichera (PhD)

Adjunct Professor  
Binghamton University-SUNY

----- Forwarded message -----

From: V. Fichera <vmfichera@gmail.com>

Date: Thu, Jul 23, 2015 at 12:23 AM

Subject: Re: Martville Mine, Town of Sterling, Cayuga County (14PR3874 and 15PR02499)

To: "Clancy, John M (DEC)" <john.clancy@dec.ny.gov>

Cc: "Perazio, Philip (PARKS)" <Philip.Perazio@parks.ny.gov>, "Vandrei, Charles (DEC)" <charles.vandrei@dec.ny.gov>, "cjf9679@yahoo.com" <cjf9679@yahoo.com>, "Bimber, David L (DEC)" <david.bimber@dec.ny.gov>, "Nikki Waters, Alliance Archaeology" <nwaters@alliancearchaeology.com>, "Lynch, Kenneth (DEC)" <kenneth.lynch@dec.ny.gov>, "McGinn, Barbara A (DEC)" <barbara.mcgin@dec.ny.gov>, Clint Halftown <clint.halftown@gmail.com>, timtwoguns@verizon.net, RachelPolansky@localsyr.com <mailto:RachelPolansky@localsyr.com>, neil@wayuga.com, Randy Lawrence <tsterlin@twcny.rr.com>, Isomers2@twcny.rr.com, Lisa Cooper <lcooper2@nycourts.gov>

Dear John Clancy:

It was my impression in speaking to both Mr. Perazio of the Parks Service and Mr. Vandrei, a DEC archaeologist, that the OPRHP's recommendation is that the entire Life of Mine area be subject to the archaeological studies before the formal granting of a mining permit to ensure the process of preservation of possible Native American heritage artifacts and remains within the area of the LOM.

I should add that Ms. Nikki Waters of Alliance Archaeological Services, who performed the first two of the studies of the four required "phase" areas of the proposed Martville mine, informed me in a phone conversation on July 2, 2015 that,

while she was engaged in the first onsite study last fall, she warned the mine operator not to log or grub the next planned area for investigation before she had the opportunity to conduct the second area study. She recounted to me her surprise to discover that her warning was not heeded: when she went to the site for the second study around April 2015, she discovered that the land had already been cleared, that no runoff protection berms had been established, etc. She did feel that, luckily, she was able to find enough undisturbed land to do the requisite diggings. Indeed, aerial photos of the site, both from the USDA on September 14, 2014 and from a private amateur drone operator on June 29, 2015, confirm her statements.

It would appear that to avoid a repetition of this (and any/all such applicant) operator's "misunderstanding" of the expected protocols, the DEC should follow the recommendations of its own archaeologist, as well as the Parks Service, that all permit applicants complete the requisite archaeological studies for the entire proposed Life of Mine area before a mining permit is granted, for the protection of Native American heritage, the land itself, and to ensure compliance with the SEQR process.

Among other interested parties, I have cc'ed on this communication the Cayuga Nation leaders with whom I have been in contact concerning these matters.

Yours truly,

Dr. V. M. Fichera (PhD)

Adjunct Professor

Binghamton University-SUNY

On Wed, Jul 22, 2015 at 4:59 PM, Clancy, John M (DEC) <[john.clancy@dec.ny.gov](mailto:john.clancy@dec.ny.gov)> wrote:

Hello Mr. Perazio. Thank you for your inquiry.

Our review on the above referenced mining permit application continues.

If a DEC mined land reclamation permit is issued, a permit condition would be included, specifically stating that an archeological investigation must be conducted in respect to cultural resources and reviewed/approved by NYS OPRHP prior to expansion of the mine into areas that have not yet been investigated.

Appropriate mitigation measures to protect cultural resources would be required, if and as needed, based on OPRHP's recommendations.

Thank you for the opportunity to clarify.

Respectfully yours,

John

From: Perazio, Philip (PARKS)  
Sent: Wednesday, July 22, 2015 1:26 PM  
To: Clancy, John M (DEC)  
Cc: Vandreli, Charles (DEC); cjh9679@yahoo.com; V. Fichera  
Subject: Martville Mine, Town of Sterling, Cayuga County (14PR3874 and 15PR02499)

Mr. Clancy,

I am contacting you regarding the above-reference project. We have reviewed archaeological reports for two segments of this property. However, it is our understanding that the life of mine permit under review by DEC encompasses a larger area than what we have reviewed. We would like to inquire whether DEC will require that the remainder of the permit area be subjected to archaeological investigation before the permit is issued or if a stipulation will be included that an investigation be conducted prior to expansion of the mine into areas that have not yet been investigated.

Thank you for your attention to this matter.

Philip A. Perazio  
Historic Preservation Program Analyst - Archaeologist

Division for Historic Preservation

New York State Parks, Recreation & Historic Preservation

Peebles Island State Park, P.O. Box 189, Waterford, NY 12188-0189

518-268-2175

Philip.Perazio@parks.ny.gov <mailto:Philip.Perazio@oprhp.state.ny.us>

[www.nyparks.com/shpo](http://www.nyparks.com/shpo)

Overview Martville mine site - clearing and palustrine 6-29-30.jpg 7-3546-00040 Christopher Construction Map.pdf

From: Traci Neftleberg [mailto:Neftleberg.Traci@epamail.epa.gov] On Behalf Of Traci Neftleberg

Sent: Friday, July 24, 2015 8:01 AM

To: Montella, Daniel

Cc: Balla, Richard

Subject: Web Inquiry Assigned: Formal complaints re: 13181 Sanford Road, Martville, NY: filled national wetland and protected Sterling Creek waters; endangered species; USACE and EPA lack of due diligence

<<<System generated notification from the New Web Inquiry database ->New Web Inquiry  
<Notes://R2NOTES3/85257204006693D5> >>>

You have been assigned a Web Inquiry document

(notes://R2NOTES3/Apps/OPM/WebInquiry.nsf/0/D0F558511C6B066F85257E8B006D4219?OpenDocument) ->

Document Link Icon

<Notes://R2NOTES3/85257204006693D5/185DE4CBF51C93E58525720900783697/D0F558511C6B066F85257E8B006D4219>

Classification: UNCLASSIFIED

Caveats: NONE

Classification: UNCLASSIFIED

Caveats: NONE